

# Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP

WORLDWIDE PLAZA  
825 EIGHTH AVENUE  
NEW YORK, NY 10019-7475

TELEPHONE: +1-212-474-1000  
FACSIMILE: +1-212-474-3700

CITYPOINT  
ONE ROPEMAKER STREET  
LONDON EC2Y 9HR  
TELEPHONE: +44-20-7453-1000  
FACSIMILE: +44-20-7860-1150

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER  
+1-212-474-1934

WRITER'S EMAIL ADDRESS  
rskaisitis@cravath.com

JOHN W. WHITE  
EVAN R. CHESLER  
KRIS F. HEINZELMAN  
B. ROBBINS KIESSLING  
ROGER D. TURNER  
PHILIP A. GELSTON  
RORY O. MILLSON  
RICHARD W. CLARY  
WILLIAM P. ROGERS, JR.  
JAMES D. COOPER  
STEPHEN L. GORDON  
DANIEL L. MOSLEY  
ROBERT H. BARON  
KEVIN J. GREHAN  
C. ALLEN PARKER  
SUSAN WEBSTER  
DAVID MERCADO  
ROWAN D. WILSON  
CHRISTINE A. VARNEY  
PETER T. BARBUR  
SANDRA C. GOLDSTEIN  
THOMAS G. RAFFERTY  
MICHAEL S. GOLDMAN  
RICHARD HALL  
JULIE A. NORTH

ANDREW W. NEEDHAM  
STEPHEN L. BURNS  
KEITH R. HUMMEL  
DAVID J. KAPPAS  
DANIEL SLIFKIN  
ROBERT I. TOWNSEND, III  
WILLIAM J. WHELAN, III  
SCOTT A. BARSHAY  
PHILIP J. BOECKMAN  
ROGER G. BROOKS  
WILLIAM V. FOGG  
FAIZA J. SAEED  
RICHARD J. STARK  
THOMAS E. DUNN  
MARK I. GREENE  
DAVID R. MARRIOTT  
MICHAEL A. PASKIN  
ANDREW J. PITTS  
MICHAEL T. REYNOLDS  
ANTONY L. RYAN  
GEORGE E. ZOBITZ  
GEORGE A. STEPHANAKIS  
DARIN P. MCATEE  
GARY A. BORNSTEIN  
TIMOTHY G. CAMERON

KARIN A. DEMASI  
LIZABETHANN R. EISEN  
DAVID S. FINKELSTEIN  
DAVID GREENWALD  
RACHEL G. SKAISTIS  
PAUL H. ZUMBRO  
JOEL F. HEROLD  
ERIC W. HILFERS  
GEORGE F. SCHOEN  
ERIK R. TAVZEL  
CRAIG F. ARCELLA  
TEENA-ANN V. SANKOORIKAL  
ANDREW R. THOMPSON  
DAMIEN R. ZOUBEK  
LAUREN ANGELLILLI  
TATIANA LAPUSHCHIK  
ERIC L. SCHIELE  
ALYSSA K. CAPLES  
JENNIFER S. CONWAY  
MINH VAN NGO  
KEVIN J. ORSINI  
MATTHEW MORREALE  
JOHN D. BURETTA  
J. WESLEY EARNHARDT  
YONATAN EVEN

BENJAMIN GRUENSTEIN  
JOSEPH D. ZAVAGLIA  
STEPHEN M. KESSING  
LAUREN A. MOSKOWITZ  
DAVID J. PERKINS  
JOHNNY G. SKUMPIJA  
J. LEONARD TETI, II  
D. SCOTT BENNETT  
TING S. CHEN  
CHRISTOPHER K. FARGO  
KENNETH C. HALCOM  
DAVID M. STUART  
JONATHAN L. DAVIS  
AARON M. GRUBER  
O. KEITH HALLAM, III  
OMID H. NASAB

SPECIAL COUNSEL  
SAMUEL C. BUTLER  
GEORGE J. GILLESPIE, III

OF COUNSEL  
MICHAEL L. SCHLER

July 16, 2015

U.S. ex rel. Kester v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp.  
No. 11 Civ. 8196 (CM) (JCF)

Dear Judge Francis:

We represent Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation (“Novartis”) in the above-referenced matter. We write in response to the July 15, 2015 letter submitted to the Court by Relator David M. Kester. (ECF No. 483.) For the reasons set forth below, we respectfully request that the Court deny the relief sought.

In his letter, Relator asks that the Court order Novartis to inform Relator by July 24, 2015, whether it will assert a good faith or advice of counsel defense with respect to the non-intervened drugs (Gleevec, Tasigna and TOBI) and to produce any corresponding waiver documents by July 31, 2015. As we previously informed Relator, the decision to waive privilege is a difficult one and although Novartis is considering the issue as quickly as it can, it needs until August 15 to reach a final determination. We believe this date provides the parties more than enough time to complete fact discovery on schedule, even if Novartis chooses to waive privilege. The current deadline for the close of fact discovery is October 30, 2015, which gives Relator two and a half months to complete discovery related to any legal advice upon which Novartis chooses to rely.

We further note that in an effort potentially to expedite our analysis of the waiver issue, Novartis asked Relator to provide clarification as to exactly what conduct Relator is challenging with respect to each of the non-intervened drugs. Currently, the broad allegations regarding the purported kickback scheme have made it challenging for Novartis to determine what legal advice may be at issue, let alone whether it should

waive privilege over such advice. Relator did not respond to our request for clarification but rather submitted his letter seeking relief from the Court.

Respectfully,



Rachel G. Skaistis

The Honorable James C. Francis  
United States Magistrate Judge  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Courthouse  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, NY 10007-1312

VIA ECF

Copies to:

All Counsel of Record

VIA ECF AND EMAIL